

# Comment on "Superconducting Gap anisotropy vs. Doping Level in High- $T_c$ Cuprates"

In a recent paper Kendziora et al [1] concluded that the superconducting gap  $\Delta(k)$  in overdoped  $\text{Bi}_2\text{Sr}_2\text{CaCu}_2\text{O}_{8+\delta}$  (Bi-2212) is isotropic. They analysed Raman spectra obtained in the  $xy(\text{B}_{1g})$  scattering geometry, which samples regions of the Fermi surface situated near the  $(\pm k, 0), (0, \pm k)$  axes in reciprocal space, and in the  $xx(\text{A}_{1g} + \text{B}_{2g})$  geometry which should yield [2–4] an approximate screened average over the Fermi surface. Their conclusion was based on the observation that pair breaking peaks occurred at approximately the same frequency in both scattering geometries, and that the normalized scattering intensity ( $I_s/I_n$ ) at low energies was strongly depleted in both geometries and appeared to be in reasonable agreement with theory. It must be noted however that their normalized intensity included the Bose-Einstein factors at different temperatures and hence the resultant ratio exhibits an artificially enhanced depletion at low energies and masks the low energy frequency dependance of the response function. Furthermore, any comparison with theory is suspect since the normal state response function is unknown. Finally, since the relative peak positions will also be very sensitive [5] to the shape of the Fermi surface and the form of the gap function, they must be used with caution when comparing the symmetry of the superconducting gap in crystals with significantly different doping levels. A consideration of the low frequency behaviour of the  $xy$  and  $xx$  spectra in conjunction with consideration of the  $\text{B}_{2g}$  spectra implies the existence of an anisotropic gap with nodes along the diagonals.

In Fig. 1 we present both the  $\text{B}_{1g}$  and  $\text{B}_{2g}$  response functions ( $\chi''$ ) which were obtained from an overdoped Bi-2212 crystal ( $T_c = 55$  K). Scattering in the  $\text{B}_{2g}$  spectrum arises from regions of the Fermi surface located near the diagonal directions in  $k$ -space and hence provides information that is complementary to the  $\text{B}_{1g}$  spectra. In both geometries it is clear (Fig. 1) that (in the superconducting state) although scattering is suppressed for  $\omega < 6k_bT_c(240\text{cm}^{-1})$  it is still present and increases linearly with  $\omega$  in this frequency region. This linear behaviour is incompatible with an isotropic s-wave gap. It is however consistent with a model proposed by Devereaux [6] for a d-wave superconductor with spin fluctuations and impurity scattering included. The linear dependance of the  $\text{B}_{2g}$  spectrum at low energies is consistent [3–5] with the presence of nodes along the diagonal directions. Hackl et al [7] also successfully interpreted data obtained from an overdoped Bi-2212 crystal in terms of the disordered d-wave model.

In conclusion the superconducting gap in overdoped Bi-2212 cannot be isotropic if spectra from all scattering

FIG. 1. The low energy  $\text{B}_{1g}$  and  $\text{B}_{2g}$  Raman spectra for an overdoped Bi-2212 crystal ( $T_c = 55$  K) in the superconducting state ( $T = 15$  K). The straight lines indicate the linear behaviour of the spectra for frequencies  $\omega < \Delta_{max}$ . The intensity of the  $\text{B}_{2g}$  spectra has been multiplied by a factor of 2.5 for comparison purposes.

geometries are considered with thermal contributions removed.

*K. C. Hewitt, T. P. Devereaux, X. K. Chen, X-Z Wang, J. G. Naeini and J. C. Irwin*

*Department of Physics, Simon Fraser University, Burnaby, B. C. V5A 1S6 Canada*

*Airton Martin*

*Instituto de Fisica "Gleb Wataghin", Universidade Estadual de Campinas, 13083-970, Campinas, Sao Paulo, Brazil*

Received February 1, 2008

PACS numbers: 74.25.Gz, 74.62.Dh, 74.72.Hs, 78.30.Er

- 
- [1] C. Kendziora, R. J. Kelley, and M. Onellion, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **77**, 727 (1996).
  - [2] X. K. Chen, J. C. Irwin, R. Liang, and W. Hardy, *Physica C* **227**, 113 (1994).
  - [3] X. K. Chen *et al.*, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **73**, 3290 (1994).
  - [4] T. P. Devereaux *et al.*, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **72**, 396 (1994).
  - [5] T. P. Devereaux, A. Virosztek, and A. Zawadowski, *Phys. Rev. B* **54**, 12523 (1996).
  - [6] T. P. Devereaux, in *Spectroscopic Studies of Superconductors*, edited by I. Bozovic and D. van der Marel (SPIE, Bellingham, 1996).
  - [7] R. Hackl *et al.*, in *Spectroscopic Studies of Superconductors*, edited by I. Bozovic and D. van der Marel (SPIE, Bellingham, 1996).

